#### NOT FOR PUBLICATION

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

IN RE: PROTON-PUMP INHIBITOR PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

2:17-MD-2789 (CCC)(LDW) (MDL 2789)

This Document Relates to: All cases listed in Exhibit A **OPINION AND ORDER** 

**CECCHI**, District Judge.

### I. Introduction

This matter comes before the Court upon Case Management Order ("CMO") No. 60, ECF No. 709, entered on November 19, 2021, which identified 962 cases in which Pfizer, Inc.<sup>1</sup> ("Pfizer") alleged that service of the summons and complaint had not been effected and in which no proof of service appeared on the docket of the case. CMO No. 60 ordered the plaintiffs in those cases within thirty days to (1) establish that service was effected on Pfizer as required by Rule 4(m) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure<sup>2</sup> by filing proof of service, (2) voluntarily dismiss Pfizer, or (3) show cause why Pfizer should not be dismissed within thirty days of entry of the Order. CMO No. 60, at 2, ECF No. 709. CMO No. 60 ordered Plaintiffs to file their responses on the dockets of the individual cases, and permitted Pfizer to oppose within thirty days of each plaintiff's response.<sup>3</sup> Plaintiffs were specifically advised that "[f]ailure to comply with the terms of this Order will result in the dismissal of the case as to Pfizer." CMO No. 60, at 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Sometimes identified as Pfiser, Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> All references to Rules herein are to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> At the request of the parties, the deadline for plaintiffs to file responses to CMO No. 60 was extended to March 31, 2022, and then June 30, 2022. *See* CMO No. 67, at § I.D, ECF No. 747; CMO No. 70, at ¶ B, ECF No. 769. The deadline for Pfizer to oppose each plaintiff's response was extended to May 15, 2022, then August 16, 2022, and then to October 17, 2022. *See* CMO No. 67, at § I.D, ECF No. 747; CMO No. 70, at ¶ B, ECF No. 769; CMO No. 78, at ¶ A, ECF No. 841.

### II. Legal Standard

Rule 4 governs the requirements regarding serving a summons. In particular, Rule 4(m) requires that "[i]f a defendant is not served 90 days after the complaint is filed, the court – on motion or on its own after notice to plaintiff – must dismiss the action without prejudice against that defendant or order that service be made within a specified time. But if the plaintiff shows good cause for the failure, the court must extend the time for service for an appropriate period." Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(m). In the Third Circuit, establishing good cause requires a "demonstration of good faith on the part of a party seeking an enlargement and some reasonable basis for noncompliance with the time specified in the rules." MCI Telecomms. Corp. v. Teleconcepts, Inc., 71 F.3d 1086, 1097 (3d Cir. 1995). In the absence of a showing of good cause for failure timely to effect service, the Court has discretion either to dismiss a case or permit an extension. *Id.* at 1098 (citing *Petrucelli v. Bohringer & Ratzinger*, 46 F.3d 1298, 1305 (3d Cir. 1995)). It is the plaintiff's burden to demonstrate good cause for such failure to effectuate timely service or to persuade the Court to exercise its discretion and not dismiss Pfizer from their cases. Spence v. Lahood, No. 11-3972, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15 (D.N.J. June 8, 2012) (citing McCurdy v. Am. Bd. of Plastic Surgery, 157 F.3d 191, 196 (3d Cir. 1998)).

### III. Discussion

As stated above, CMO No. 60 ordered the identified plaintiffs within thirty days to either establish that service was properly effectuated pursuant to Rule 4(m), voluntarily dismiss Pfizer,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Plaintiffs note that the version of Rule 4 quoted in *MCI Telecomms* is no longer applicable after an amendment in 1993. The amendment removed "good cause" as an absolute prerequisite for an extension of service. However, as explained above, the good cause standard still exists in Rule 4(m). The amendment merely allows courts, in the absence of good cause, to exercise their discretion to allow an extension if the circumstances warrant. Notably, the Court's Opinion and Order here is based on the current version of Rule 4(m).

or show cause why Pfizer should not be dismissed. CMO No. 60 did not provide these plaintiffs with an extension of time to serve the Complaint, instead, it directed Plaintiffs to prove that service had in fact been effectuated or to "show cause why Pfizer should not be dismissed."

The 640 plaintiffs in the cases identified on Exhibit A herein ("Plaintiffs") have failed to satisfy the requirements of CMO No. 60. Plaintiffs do not claim to have timely served Pfizer and fail to show cause why these cases should proceed despite their lack of compliance with Rule 4(m). See CMO No. 7, at § II.D ("Absent agreement of the parties or subsequent Order of the Court, service of process shall be effectuated as required under Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure."). Pfizer did not agree to any modifications to service procedures from those set forth in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Pfizer did not agree to accept service via e-mail, nor did it agree to receive waivers of service via e-mail. Cf. CMO No. 7, at § II.D, ECF No. 112; CMO No. 27, at § I.D, ECF No. 260; CMO No. 32, ECF No. 396; CMO No. 79, ECF No. 842.

Of the 640 cases at issue here, Plaintiffs and Pfizer agree that Pfizer had not been served at all in 61 of them. In the other 579 cases, Plaintiffs concede that Pfizer was served only after CMO No. 60 was entered. Of the 579 cases where one or both of the parties assert that Pfizer was served after CMO No. 60 (and utilizing the earlier purported date of service in the event that the parties did not agree on the date of service), service was made between one to two years after the ninety-day period in Rule 4(m) in 41 cases; between two to three years after the ninety-day period in 80 cases; and between three to just over four years after the ninety-day period in 458 cases. No Plaintiff here has dismissed Pfizer from their case. Accordingly, due to untimely service and lack of good cause shown, it is appropriate that Pfizer be dismissed from the cases identified in Exhibit A.

a. Plaintiffs Do Not Demonstrate Good Cause Mandating an Extension of Time to Serve

Plaintiffs' responses to CMO No. 60 do not demonstrate good cause excusing their lack of timely service pursuant to Rule 4(m). Good cause requires "a demonstration of good faith on the part of the party seeking an enlargement . . . and some reasonable basis for noncompliance with the time specified in the rules." *MCI Telecomms. Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1097. To determine whether good cause exists, the Court considers "(1) reasonableness of plaintiff's efforts to serve (2) prejudice to the defendant by lack of timely service and (3) whether plaintiff moved for an enlargement of time to serve." *Id.* The primary focus must always be on "the plaintiff's reasons for not complying with the time limit in the first place." *Id.* Yet here, Plaintiffs have not even attempted to show good cause for their failure to timely serve or addressed the reasons for untimeliness. *See, e.g.*, Pl. Allen Pyne's Resp. to Orders to Show Cause Regarding Service of Process, Ex. A, No. 2:18-cv-06938, ECF No. 10-1 ("Pyne Resp."). Accordingly, as the Court further explains, Plaintiffs have failed to demonstrate good cause for failure to timely serve in compliance with Rule 4(m).

As an initial matter, the Court notes that Plaintiffs responded to CMO No. 60 by filing virtually identical responses that do not reference Pfizer's specific conduct. These responses attached an exhibit with limited information about the Plaintiffs' individual cases, but did not include any documentation to support their assertions in the exhibit. The information in these exhibits filed by Plaintiffs includes such information as the date of alleged service (if any), whether a defendant had filed a notice of appearance, whether a defendant had filed a short form answer, whether a Plaintiff Fact Sheet had been uploaded to Marker Group, whether a Defense Fact Sheet had been served, and whether a defendant had sent a deficiency letter related to the Plaintiff Fact Sheet. *See, e.g.*, Pyne Resp.; Nancy Hignite's Resp. to Order to Show Cause Regarding Service of Process, No. 2:18-cv-02649, ECF No. 12 ("Hignite Resp."). In addition, Plaintiffs' briefing does

not address any reasons for the failure to timely serve and instead focuses on arguments concerning Pfizer's purported waiver of service and the Court's authority for discretionary extensions. *See Houser v. Williams*, No. 16-9072, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 43518, at \*6 (D.N.J. Mar. 12, 2020) (citing *MCI Telecomms. Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1097) (finding dismissal warranted where plaintiff did not serve the complaint for months after an agreed-upon extension and then failed to detail any steps he took towards serving defendant within the extended time afforded by the court).

Turning to the factors for evaluating good cause, the first factor examines the reasonableness of the plaintiff's efforts to serve the complaint. As noted, Plaintiffs offer no explanation for the failure to timely serve, nor an adequate description of reasonable steps that plaintiffs took to effectuate timely service as required by Rule 4(m). And none of the Plaintiffs at issue here were close to satisfying timely service under Rule 4(m). As previously stated, in 579 cases, service was effected at least one year after the ninety-day period under Rule 4(m) had lapsed; in 458 of the 579 cases, or 79 percent, service was effected over three years after the ninety-day period under Rule 4(m) had lapsed. The 61 Plaintiffs who have never served Pfizer also did not provide any explanation justifying why they have yet to serve Pfizer. Given Plaintiffs' lack of sufficient efforts to serve the complaint, this factor weighs heavily in favor of Pfizer.

Under the second factor, the Court considers prejudice to Pfizer by lack of timely service. Here, Plaintiffs' failure to serve caused Pfizer to expend time and resources through investigation, consultation with opposing counsel, and advocating for and responding to case management orders – all to determine whether Plaintiffs intended to pursue litigation against them. *W. Coasts Quartz Corp. v. M.E.C. Tech, Inc.*, 2017 WL 1944197, at \*2 (D.N.J. May 9, 2017). Moreover, this Court has previously determined that Pfizer has been prejudiced by the delayed service or non-service. *See* Order Regarding CMO No. 60, at 7, ECF No. 887. Given the prejudice to Pfizer resulting

from Plaintiffs' failure to timely serve, this factor cuts against good cause. Even if Plaintiffs had demonstrated lack of prejudice to Pfizer, "absence of prejudice alone can never constitute good cause to excuse late service." *MCI Telecomms Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1097.

Finally, under the third factor, while Plaintiffs have now requested an extension of time to serve Pfizer, they did so only after CMO No. 60 was entered, which was a year or more after the time to serve Pfizer in compliance with Rule 4(m) had lapsed. *See, e.g.*, Pyne Resp.; Hignite Resp. Plaintiffs have not explained why they did not request an extension of time to serve Pfizer until after CMO No. 60 was entered by this Court. Accordingly, this factor similarly weighs in favor of Pfizer and against Plaintiffs' showing of good cause.

Considering the three factors used to evaluate whether good cause has been demonstrated, Plaintiffs here have not demonstrated good cause for their failure to serve Pfizer in compliance with Rule 4(m).

# b. Plaintiffs Have Not Persuaded the Court That a Discretionary Extension is Warranted

In the absence of a showing of good cause mandating an extension to effectuate service, the Court nonetheless has discretion to either dismiss the case or permit extension. Because Plaintiffs have not established good cause, *see supra*, they must rely on the Court's discretionary authority to excuse failures to comply with Rule 4(m). *See Edwards v. Hillman*, 849 F. App'x. 23, 25 (3d Cir. 2021) (citing *Petrucelli*, 46 F.3d at 1305). The Court's exercise of discretion in this area is guided by various factors, including: "actual notice of the legal action; prejudice to the defendant; the statute of limitations on the underlying causes of action; the conduct of the defendant; and whether the plaintiff is represented by counsel, in addition to any other factor that may be relevant." *Chiang v. U.S. Small Bus. Admin.*, 331 Fed. App'x 113, 116 (3d Cir. 2009); *see also Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15. Here, considering these factors, Plaintiffs have

not met their burden in persuading the Court that such discretion should be exercised under these circumstances.

With respect to the first factor—actual notice of the legal action—Plaintiffs argue that Pfizer was on notice of their claims through their tolling agreement, which provided Plaintiffs time to obtain information about their claims before filing a complaint. However, the fact that a plaintiff was on the tolling agreement and may potentially bring a claim against Pfizer or another defendant does not mean that Pfizer had actual legal notice that a particular plaintiff would be pursuing his or her claim against Pfizer in a legal action.

In re Asbestos Prod. Liab. Litig. (No. VI), upon which Plaintiffs rely for their argument that a court may extend the time for proper service if the defendant had "actual notice of the pending action," is instructive. 2014 WL 1903904, at \*1 (E.D. Pa., May 12, 2014); see Pyne Resp. at 10 (citing Asbestos). The issue there concerned the appropriateness of a specific method of service by mail under Ohio law—not untimely service that occurred anywhere from one to four years past the Rule 4(m) deadline. Notably, the court found that the defendants were on "actual legal notice" of the pending action because the plaintiffs provided proof of a green card signed by the defendant, evidencing receipt of the original process papers by defendants' counsel, which the court found acceptable under Ohio state law. Asbestos, 2014 WL 1903904, at \*1. By contrast, Plaintiffs here have not offered any similar evidence of actual notice. Indeed, as Pfizer argues, the tolling

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In June 2018, the parties entered into a tolling agreement concerning the statute of limitations. In order to obtain the benefit of tolling under the tolling agreement, a claimant had to provide the following information to all defendants: name and date of birth of the PPI user, name(s) of any derivative claimant(s), city and state of residence, date of first PPI use, date of last PPI use, alleged injury, and name of claimant's counsel. The Plaintiffs' Steering Committee was to compile this information and submit it to the defendants on an Excel spreadsheet on a monthly basis. *See* Stip. Regarding Tolling of Stats. of Lims., ECF No. 232, at 1-2. The data required to be provided to all defendants in the tolling agreement did not identify specific defendants whose product(s) were allegedly used by individual plaintiffs.

agreement "covered Plaintiffs who could not yet show proof of use as to a Pfizer product" and, moreover, did not identify a specific defendant or which PPI products were at issue as to a particular potential plaintiff. *See, e.g.*, No. 18-cv-04095, ECF No. 19 at 10 n.3. Therefore, Plaintiffs' reliance on *Asbestos* is misplaced and they have not demonstrated that Pfizer had actual notice of pending litigation.

Turning to prejudice to the defendant—the second factor—the Court reiterates its analysis when discussing the same factor in the context of good cause. *See supra* III.a (noting Pfizer expended time and resources through its repeated attempts to determine whether Plaintiffs intended to pursue litigation against them, including its own independent inquiries, as well as meetings with counsel and the special master). Further, this Court has previously found in this MDL (with respect to a different defendant) that "[w]asted time and resources and inconvenience standing alone may constitute sufficient prejudice to warrant dismissal." CMO No. 63 at 7 (citing *Miller v. Advocare, LLC*, No. 12-01069, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 71451, at \*8-9 (D.N.J. May 21, 2013). Accordingly, this factor weighs against Plaintiffs' request.

Regarding the statute of limitations, the third factor, Plaintiffs argue that the applicable statute of limitations in most, if not all, of the actions subject to CMO No. 60 has expired. *See, e.g.,* Pyne Resp. at 21. However, "the expiration of the statute of limitations does not require the court to extend the time for service, as the court has discretion to dismiss the case even if the refiling of the action is barred." *MCI Telecomms. Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1098. Given the length of time between filing and service in the cases of these Plaintiffs—in some cases over four years—Plaintiffs' argument that the potential lapse of the statute of limitations warrants extension is not compelling. Relatedly, Plaintiffs have not alleged that Pfizer engaged in any conduct to impede or

frustrate timely service. *See Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15 (fourth factor). These factors thus militate against a discretionary extension as well.

The final factor guiding the Court's discretion examines whether the plaintiff is represented by counsel. *See Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15. Plaintiffs here are all represented by counsel. And, in this context, "[e]ven when delay [in service] results from inadvertence of counsel, it need not be excused." *Petrucelli*, 46 F.3d at 1307. This factor thus also weighs against a discretionary extension.

Weighing all of the above factors, the Court is not persuaded that exercising its discretion to grant an extension to effectuate service on Pfizer is warranted. Moreover, in addition to the factors counseling against an extension, the Court's conclusion is further supported by Plaintiffs' failure to provide an explanation as to why they did not timely serve Pfizer (in the 579 cases where service was late) or why they did not serve Pfizer at all (in the remaining 61 cases).<sup>6</sup>

## c. Plaintiffs Have Not Shown that Pfizer Waived its Defense to Untimely Service

Plaintiffs generally assert that Pfizer waived any defense related to untimely service by virtue of its conduct in this MDL litigation. Plaintiffs argue that dismissal of their claims against Pfizer is inappropriate in those cases where (1) Pfizer either filed an answer without raising service or answered before service; (2) Pfizer filed a motion to dismiss without raising service; or (3) Pfizer manifested some intention to defend the case through Pfizer's conduct. *See, e.g.*, Pyne

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Pfizer also argues that because Plaintiffs did not address their reasons for untimely service (and instead relied chiefly on arguments concerning waiver), Plaintiffs' reply to CMO 60 failed to comply with a court order, requiring dismissal of their cases on that independent basis. . *See, e.g.,* No. 2:18-cv-04095, ECF No. 19 at 6. Pfizer cites certain *Poulis* factors to support this argument. *Id.* at 10. As explained above, the Court has considered Plaintiffs' lack of an explanation in its discussion of Rule 4(m) and discretionary extensions.

Respo. at § IV.B; Hignite Resp. at § IV.B. For the below reasons, the Court finds that Pfizer has not waived its defense to untimely service.

The Court first turns to Plaintiffs' argument that Pfizer waived service either by filing an answer without raising service or by answering before service. Plaintiffs assert that, as a general matter, waiver of service may occur where a defendant files an answer as its first responsive pleading and the answer fails to plead the defense. See, e.g., Pyne Resp. at 7. Accordingly, Plaintiffs argue that there are three potential scenarios where service has been waived by answer. First, Plaintiffs claim that in any case where Pfizer filed a short form answer, service was waived because the short form answer simply incorporated Pfizer's initial long form answer. This, Plaintiffs maintain, is because the long form answer did not assert the defense of lack of service. See, e.g., id. Second, since a defendant's notice of appearance in a specific case may serve as a short form answer, see Case Management Order No. 27 (ECF No. 260), Plaintiffs contend that a notice of appearance after service is functionally the same as a short form answer—it incorporates the long form answer, which does not assert the defense of lack of service. Finally, Plaintiffs argue that a notice of appearance before service waives this defense under the terms of Case Management Order No. 27 for cases filed after September 24, 2018. See, e.g., Pyne Resp. at 8; see also CMO No. 27, at § I.A.

Regardless of the merits of these arguments as a matter of law, none of these scenarios are applicable to Pfizer here. Only two Plaintiffs in the cases identified in Exhibit A assert that a "Defendant" actually filed an answer or filed a notice of appearance in their case, but the dockets in those two cases clearly reflect that Pfizer did not file an answer or notice of appearance in those two cases. *See* Pl. Sharon Nali's Resp. to Order to Show Cause, Ex. A, 2:18-cv-07667, ECF No. 14-1; Pl. Carol Presley's Resp. to Order to Show Cause, Ex. A, 2:19-cv-16903, ECF No. 6-1. With

these two Plaintiffs' specific assertions contradicted by their dockets, none of the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A have shown that Pfizer either filed a short form answer or a notice of appearance. Thus, Plaintiffs' arguments asserting waiver based on Pfizer's answers (or appearances) do not apply here.

Turning to Plaintiffs' next argument, Plaintiffs assert that Pfizer waived its defense to lack of service in those cases where Pfizer filed a motion to dismiss for purported failure to comply with the tolling agreement without specifically raising the defense of service. However, Pfizer did not raise service in its motions to dismiss because an alternate procedure, proposed and agreed upon by the parties, was set forth in a stipulated court order, with their defenses expressly preserved by CMO No. 7. See CMO No. 7, ECF No. 112, at 7 ("Defendants also reserve all rights to move to dismiss . . . under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure Rule [] 12. Defendants shall only be permitted to file said motions to dismiss subject to leave of this Court."). CMO No. 7 expressly restricted defendants from moving to dismiss individual plaintiffs under Rule 12 absent leave of this Court. The federal rules bar a defendant from later moving to dismiss for insufficient service of process only when the party "could have raised these objections in their [earlier] motion to dismiss the complaint." Denkins v. William Penn Sch. Dist., No. 20-02228, 2020 WL 5880132, at \*3 (E.D. Pa. Oct. 2, 2020); accord Wright & Miller, 5C Fed. Prac. & Proc. Civ. § 1391 ("If one or more of these defenses are omitted from the initial motion but were 'then available' to the movant, they are permanently lost."). In filing its authorized dismissal motions pursuant to the tolling agreement and CMO No. 7, Pfizer did not have leave to raise any other defense, including insufficient service as to a particular case. Having understood and agreed that such motions were to be deferred to a later date and with leave of the Court, it is not correct that Pfizer, or any other defendant, waived

its defense of service by failing to argue it in their motions to dismiss related to purported violations of the tolling agreement.

Plaintiffs' final argument on waiver is that Pfizer waived its defense of service through its conduct in the PPI litigation as a whole or in individual cases. As to the argument that Pfizer waived service through its conduct in the PPI litigation as a whole, plaintiffs rely on *In re Cathode Ray Tube (CRT) Antitrust Litigation*, No. 07-5944, 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 78902 (N.D. Cal. June 9, 2014). In that case, certain defendants raised their Rule 12(b)(5) defense to service in a consolidated motion to dismiss, but subsequently abandoned that 12(b)(5) motion in a later filing and then continued to participate in litigation for four years. The court found that under these circumstances those defendants had waived their defense of lack of service. *Id.* at \*84-88. The case is inapposite, however, as Pfizer never previously raised—and abandoned—the defense of service in any of the cases identified here, and indeed was unable to without leave of the Court under CMO No. 7, as agreed to by the parties.

Additionally, Plaintiffs' general response argues that Pfizer waived its defense of service by participating in the litigation of individual cases, citing *In re: Ethicon, Inc.*, No. 2:13-cv-00758, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 148765 (S.D.W.V. Oct. 27, 2016). In that case, the defendants acknowledged receipt of a plaintiff profile form, requested additional information from the plaintiffs regarding their claims, and threatened to pursue a remedy in court if the plaintiff did not comply with their request. *Id.* at \*6. While eighty-four Plaintiffs herein claim that they received a deficiency letter related to their Plaintiff Fact Sheet, they do not specifically allege whether Pfizer or another defendant sent that deficiency letter, nor did they include a copy of the deficiency letter in their response. Pfizer's counsel has represented that Pfizer did not issue any Plaintiff Fact Sheet deficiency letters to the plaintiffs in the cases identified in Exhibit A hereto and that it has not

threatened to pursue a judicial remedy if the plaintiff did not cure the deficiency. In short, none of these plaintiffs has actually demonstrated that Pfizer has meaningfully participated in the litigation in their particular case. Further, the Court rejects Plaintiffs' suggestion to impute Pfizer's conduct in defending itself in cases not subject to CMO No. 60 to suggest that Pfizer waived its defense of service of process in the specific cases identified in Exhibit A hereto.

Plaintiffs also assert that Pfizer has waited too long to assert its defense of service. Plaintiffs rely on the Sixth Circuit's decision in *King v. Taylor*; however, in that case, unlike here, the defendant actively litigated the case by filing a joint Rule 26(f) report, participating in depositions, seeking to extend discovery deadlines, and joining in a status report in that particular case, and only moved to dismiss for lack of service at the summary judgment stage. *King v. Taylor*, 694 F.3d 650, 659-61 (6<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2012). Here, however, none of the cases identified in Exhibit A is a Bellwether case or a Wave case and thus Pfizer has not participated in discovery in their individual cases like the defendant in *Taylor* did, and as noted previously, stipulated CMO No. 7 precluded Pfizer from filing a motion to dismiss for lack of service without leave of the Court.

### IV. Conclusion

CMO No. 60 required Plaintiffs to (1) show they timely served Pfizer pursuant to Rule 4(m), (2) dismiss Pfizer from their case, or (3) show cause why this Court should not dismiss Pfizer from their cases. Plaintiffs whose cases are on Exhibit A have failed to meet their burden of demonstrating good cause for failure to comply with CMO No. 60 and effectuate timely service, and have failed to persuade the Court to exercise its discretion not to dismiss Pfizer from their

cases. Accordingly, this Court denies Plaintiffs' requests for extensions and orders Pfizer to be dismissed without prejudice from the cases identified in Exhibit A.<sup>7</sup>

Accordingly, **IT IS** on this <u>24</u> day of April, 2023;

**ORDERED** that Pfizer shall be **DISMISSED** without prejudice from the cases identified in Exhibit A hereto.

SO ORDERED.

CLAIRE C. CECCHI, U.S.D.J.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> To the extent plaintiffs in the cases identified in Exhibit A hereto have raised in their briefing any arguments not expressly addressed herein, the Court has considered and rejected them.

1 Nancy Hignite 2:18-cv-02649 2 James U. Hodges 2:18-cv-02952 3 Ruthe A. Hensley 2:18-cv-03235 4 Antonio D. Davis 2:18-cv-03775 5 Misty Ashley 2:18-cv-03851 6 David Frost 2:18-cv-03861 7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall 2:18-cv-03881 8 Lynda D. McKibben 2:18-cv-03888 9 Leonore L. Sosa 2:18-cv-03886 10 Garrett Sons 2:18-cv-03889 11 Todd K. Andrade 2:18-cv-04040 12 Norman Kydd 2:18-cv-04040 12 Norman Kydd 2:18-cv-04048 13 Della I. Gregg 2:18-cv-04048 14 Denver Kennett 2:18-cv-04078 15 John Ortiz 2:18-cv-04078 15 John Ortiz 2:18-cv-04078 16 Mike Moffat 2:18-cv-04139 17 Laurie T. Lum 2:18-cv-04159 18 Betty L. Sanner 2:18-cv-04169 19 William Ketelsen 2:18-cv-04180 21 Grady Harris 2:18-cv-04180 21 Grady Harris 2:18-cv-04181 22 Daniel Sharp 2:18-cv-04184 23 Theresa Johnson 2:18-cv-04208 24 Mary A. Williams 2:18-cv-04208 25 Rayshell Robinson 2:18-cv-04208 26 Deborah Allen 2:18-cv-04290 30 Judy K. Aiken 2:18-cv-04290 30 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04290 30 Stella Benefiel 2:18-cv-04290 31 Stella Benefiel 2:18-cv-04290
3 Ruthe A. Hensley 2:18-cv-03235 4 Antonio D. Davis 2:18-cv-03775 5 Misty Ashley 2:18-cv-03851 6 David Frost 2:18-cv-03881 7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall 2:18-cv-03881 8 Lynda D. McKibben 2:18-cv-03888 9 Leonore L. Sosa 2:18-cv-03886 10 Garrett Sons 2:18-cv-03886 11 Todd K. Andrade 2:18-cv-04040 12 Norman Kydd 2:18-cv-04040 13 Della I. Gregg 2:18-cv-04054 14 Denver Kennett 2:18-cv-04078 15 John Ortiz 2:18-cv-04078 16 Mike Moffat 2:18-cv-04079 17 Laurie T. Lum 2:18-cv-04139 17 Laurie T. Lum 2:18-cv-04159 18 Betty L. Sanner 2:18-cv-04169 19 William Ketelsen 2:18-cv-04176 20 Tia Hartmann 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04206 24 Mary A. Williams 2:18-cv-04208 25 Rayshell Robinson 2:18-cv-04208 26 Patricia Bean 2:18-cv-04283 29 Michael Barrett 2:18-cv-04299 30 Judy K. Aiken 3 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04298 31 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04298
3 Ruthe A. Hensley 2:18-cv-03235 4 Antonio D. Davis 2:18-cv-03775 5 Misty Ashley 2:18-cv-03851 6 David Frost 2:18-cv-03881 7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall 2:18-cv-03881 8 Lynda D. McKibben 2:18-cv-03888 9 Leonore L. Sosa 2:18-cv-03886 10 Garrett Sons 2:18-cv-03886 11 Todd K. Andrade 2:18-cv-04040 12 Norman Kydd 2:18-cv-04040 13 Della I. Gregg 2:18-cv-04054 14 Denver Kennett 2:18-cv-04078 15 John Ortiz 2:18-cv-04078 16 Mike Moffat 2:18-cv-04079 17 Laurie T. Lum 2:18-cv-04139 17 Laurie T. Lum 2:18-cv-04159 18 Betty L. Sanner 2:18-cv-04169 19 William Ketelsen 2:18-cv-04176 20 Tia Hartmann 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04180 2:18-cv-04206 24 Mary A. Williams 2:18-cv-04208 25 Rayshell Robinson 2:18-cv-04208 26 Patricia Bean 2:18-cv-04283 29 Michael Barrett 2:18-cv-04299 30 Judy K. Aiken 3 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04298 31 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04298
5 Misty Ashley       2:18-cv-03851         6 David Frost       2:18-cv-03861         7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall       2:18-cv-03881         8 Lynda D. McKibben       2:18-cv-03885         9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03894         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-04040         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04048         13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04159         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04208         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04296         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04298         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04298
6 David Frost       2:18-cv-03861         7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall       2:18-cv-03881         8 Lynda D. McKibben       2:18-cv-03885         9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03886         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-03894         11 Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04040         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04048         13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04283         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04298         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
6 David Frost       2:18-cv-03861         7 Lester Hall and Ruth E. Hall       2:18-cv-03881         8 Lynda D. McKibben       2:18-cv-03885         9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03886         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-03894         11 Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04040         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04048         13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04283         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04298         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
8 Lynda D. McKibben       2:18-cv-03885         9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03894         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-04040         11 Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04048         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04281         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04298         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
8 Lynda D. McKibben       2:18-cv-03885         9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03894         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-04040         11 Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04048         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04281         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04298         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
9 Leonore L. Sosa       2:18-cv-03886         10 Garrett Sons       2:18-cv-03894         11 Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04040         12 Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04054         13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04078         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04281         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
11       Todd K. Andrade       2:18-cv-04040         12       Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04048         13       Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14       Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15       John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16       Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17       Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18       Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19       William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20       Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21       Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22       Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23       Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24       Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25       Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26       Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27       Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28       Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04293         30       Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31       Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32       Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04298         33
12       Norman Kydd       2:18-cv-04048         13       Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14       Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15       John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16       Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17       Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18       Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19       William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20       Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21       Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22       Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23       Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24       Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25       Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26       Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27       Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28       Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04290         30       Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31       Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32       Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04298         33       Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
13 Della I. Gregg       2:18-cv-04054         14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
14 Denver Kennett       2:18-cv-04078         15 John Ortiz       2:18-cv-04095         16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04293         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
16 Mike Moffat       2:18-cv-04139         17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
17 Laurie T. Lum       2:18-cv-04159         18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
18 Betty L. Sanner       2:18-cv-04169         19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
19 William Ketelsen       2:18-cv-04176         20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
20 Tia Hartmann       2:18-cv-04180         21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04206         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
21 Grady Harris       2:18-cv-04181         22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
22 Daniel Sharp       2:18-cv-04184         23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
23 Theresa Johnson       2:18-cv-04206         24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
24 Mary A. Williams       2:18-cv-04208         25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
25 Rayshell Robinson       2:18-cv-04215         26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
26 Deborah Allen       2:18-cv-04281         27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
27 Sharon Acevedo       2:18-cv-04282         28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
28 Patricia Bean       2:18-cv-04283         29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
29 Michael Barrett       2:18-cv-04290         30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
30 Judy K. Aiken       2:18-cv-04291         31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
31 Dale Bryan       2:18-cv-04293         32 Tonya Bates-Wilson       2:18-cv-04296         33 Donna J. Cushenberry       2:18-cv-04298
32 Tonya Bates-Wilson2:18-cv-0429633 Donna J. Cushenberry2:18-cv-04298
33 Donna J. Cushenberry 2:18-cv-04298
·
5 1/5 CM 07307
35 Roosevelt Dunning 2:18-cv-04305
36 Gloria Eddy 2:18-cv-04308
37 Edgardo Biliran 2:18-cv-04309
38 Emma Balthazar 2:18-cv-04312
39 Antionette Borden 2:18-cv-04315
40 Shelley Hager, as Administrator of the Estate of Samuel Hager, Deceased 2:18-cv-04317
41 Anthony Elliott 2:18-cv-04318
42 Kevin Casey 2:18-cv-04319
43 George Curry 2:18-cv-04326
44 Deloris Daniel 2:18-cv-04330
45 Ricky Fisher 2:18-cv-04332

4.0	Devid D. Healine	2.40 - 04250
-	David D. Hopkins	2:18-cv-04350
	Dennis Ledford and Tracey Ledford	2:18-cv-04477
	Rozell Collins	2:18-cv-04482
	Cassandra Howard	2:18-cv-04484
	Patricia Cooper	2:18-cv-04491
	Leray Littell	2:18-cv-04492
-	Tony Long	2:18-cv-04495
	Sandra Davis	2:18-cv-04496
	Robert Parham, Jr.	2:18-cv-04497
55	Climmie Gibbons	2:18-cv-04499
56	Teresa Harlen, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Jack R. Harlen, Deceased	2:18-cv-04500
57	Vivian Parker	2:18-cv-04501
58	Heather P. Lott	2:18-cv-04502
59	Virginia Rackins	2:18-cv-04504
60	Otis D. Roberts	2:18-cv-04507
61	Robert Ludlam, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Aubie Ludlam, Deceased	2:18-cv-04511
62	Jessie Martin	2:18-cv-04519
63	Mary Hankamer	2:18-cv-04520
64	Brenda R. Dale	2:18-cv-04526
65	Kelly Smith	2:18-cv-04529
66	Mary Haynes	2:18-cv-04535
67	Betty Head	2:18-cv-04538
68	Jerome Browning	2:18-cv-04827
69	Clarence Mumma	2:18-cv-04828
70	Beverly Bryant	2:18-cv-04829
71	Jose Fronda	2:18-cv-04830
72	Rolanda Allmon	2:18-cv-04831
73	Constance Guardado	2:18-cv-04833
74	Steve Slade	2:18-cv-04843
	Donell Andrews	2:18-cv-04852
76	Joyce Watson	2:18-cv-04864
77	Jeanette Williams	2:18-cv-04868
78	Avis Hiestand	2:18-cv-04871
79	Roger Mata	2:18-cv-04872
	Linda Bishop	2:18-cv-04873
	Darlene Mason	2:18-cv-04874
82	Laura Raffa	2:18-cv-04877
83	Scott Allen	2:18-cv-04882
84	Max Holbrook and Joyce Holbrook	2:18-cv-04888
	Mildred Brock	2:18-cv-04904
	Unni Shelton	2:18-cv-04915
	Darwin Watson	2:18-cv-04918
	Terry Debruyn	2:18-cv-04921
	John M. Sierra	2:18-cv-04923
	Woodie G. Murphy	2:18-cv-04933
- 55		

91	Oscar M. Chavez	2:18-cv-04936
92	Priscilla Smeets	2:18-cv-04938
93	Paula Ford	2:18-cv-04943
94	Joseph Spurgeon and Sambra Spurgeon	2:18-cv-04948
95	Roger Phillips	2:18-cv-05034
96	Billie Martin Stinson	2:18-cv-05038
97	Wanda Thomas	2:18-cv-05040
98	Lorenzo Valenzuela	2:18-cv-05055
99	Brenda Jo Lemley	2:18-cv-05060
100	Helen Waddle	2:18-cv-05061
101	Rodrick Whitaker	2:18-cv-05068
102	Dawn Miller	2:18-cv-05069
103	Robert Dryden	2:18-cv-05081
104	Charla Mogg	2:18-cv-05084
	Maudell Palmer	2:18-cv-05306
	Fred L. Johns	2:18-cv-05314
	Daniella Nowman, as Proposed Penrosentative of the Estate of lack E	
1071	Newman, Deceased	2:18-cv-05324
	Peggy S. Conley	2:18-cv-05343
	Dwight W. Graley, Sr.	2:18-cv-05345
	Scott Hannigan	2:18-cv-05351
	Birdie D. Jackson	2:18-cv-05353
	Rebecca M Oates	2:18-cv-05360
	David Pierce	2:18-cv-05361
	Teresa Byers	2:18-cv-05431
	Donald Gibson	2:18-cv-05438
	Michael Clarke and Maribeth Clarke	2:18-cv-05448
	Sandra Garrett	2:18-cv-05463
	Nancy L. Harsh	2:18-cv-05466
	Bryan G. Swanson	2:18-cv-05476
	Melvin Stubbs	2:18-cv-05479
	Jennifer Wolfe	2:18-cv-05485
	Sharon Powers	2:18-cv-05488
	Arthur D. Warshawsky	2:18-cv-05490
	Martha Burns	2:18-cv-05495
		2:18-cv-05500
	,	2:18-cv-05504
		2:18-cv-05511
		2:18-cv-05516
	Shirley Teel, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Ezra C. Teel	
129	Deceased	2:18-cv-05521
130	James Wellman	2:18-cv-05525
131	Dara Dougherty	2:18-cv-05954
132	Sheryl Gerald	2:18-cv-05959
133	Samantha Riddle	2:18-cv-05971
134	Gwenda Steele	2:18-cv-05975
125 126 127 128 129 130 131 132	Kyle Rose Jeffrey Jones Burma G. Sizemore Carmen Stevens Shirley Teel, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Ezra C. Teel, Deceased James Wellman Dara Dougherty Sheryl Gerald Samantha Riddle	2:18-cv-05500 2:18-cv-05502 2:18-cv-05512 2:18-cv-05510 2:18-cv-05522 2:18-cv-05954 2:18-cv-05959 2:18-cv-05972

135	Barbara Gibson, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Alta Gibson, Deceased	2:18-cv-05976
136	George Hawkins	2:18-cv-05980
137	Willie Anderson	2:18-cv-06130
138	Mary Hollander	2:18-cv-06148
139	Lance Faulkner	2:18-cv-06154
140	Jeffrey Reed	2:18-cv-06159
141	Sharon Reid	2:18-cv-06164
142	Bartholomew Gaiera and Karen Gaiera	2:18-cv-06166
143	Kathlene Brown	2:18-cv-06171
144	Joni Barrows	2:18-cv-06178
145	Rebecca Harrington	2:18-cv-06196
146	Patricia Hasty	2:18-cv-06202
147	Richard Jackson and Judy Fontenot	2:18-cv-06214
148	Bonnie L. Mize	2:18-cv-06232
149	Jackie Knight	2:18-cv-06233
150	Tunya Lowe	2:18-cv-06256
151	Patina Johnson	2:18-cv-06274
152	Cristy Blankenship	2:18-cv-06436
153	Johnny Daniels	2:18-cv-06440
154	Emilee Palmer and Michael D. Palmer	2:18-cv-06449
155	Travis Charlton, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cynthia Halbert, Deceased	2:18-cv-06476
156	Nina Fernandez, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Sanra Nobil, Deceased	2:18-cv-06497
157	Elizabeth Prater	2:18-cv-06506
	Jerry Blosser, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate of	
158	Wanda Blosser, Deceased	2:18-cv-06515
159	Norma Stillwagoner	2:18-cv-06520
160	Karen Keenan, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate	2:18-cv-06522
	of Larry Keenan, Deceased	
161	Gina Zerby, Individully and as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Michael Zerby, Deceased	2:18-cv-06532
162	Michelle Wilson	2:18-cv-06540
163	Emilly Knotts, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cheryl Stefenel, Deceased	2:18-cv-06552
164	Jacquelyn Booker	2:18-cv-06834
	Dianne Caldwell	2:18-cv-06846
166	Leona Collins, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:18-cv-06869
167	Deniese Collins, Deceased Patrick Connors	2:18-cv-06876
	Allen Pyne	2:18-cv-06876 2:18-cv-06938
	Gladys Maddox	2:18-cv-06939
	Johnnie Oliver	2:18-cv-06939 2:18-cv-06947
1/0	Betty Bassett, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	Z.10-UV-U0947
171	Robert Avera, Deceased	2:18-cv-06949

	Charles I and a December of the Fitter of Visit States	
172	Charles Jones, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Victoria Jones, deceased	2:18-cv-06952
173	Danny Parker	2:18-cv-06964
174	Patricia Parker	2:18-cv-06975
175	Charles Howard	2:18-cv-06986
176	Teresa Hill-Ibrahim	2:18-cv-07005
177	Judy Bradshaw, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.10 0. 07040
1//	Jimmy Bradshaw, Deceased	2:18-cv-07049
178	Victor Sackett	2:18-cv-07059
179	Virginia Boyd	2:18-cv-07090
180	Herbert Johnson	2:18-cv-07130
181	Joan Stoveken, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Gay	2,10 av 07127
181	Stoveken, Deceased	2:18-cv-07137
182	Angela Spicer, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.10 av 07140
182	James Spicer, Deceased	2:18-cv-07148
400	Amanda Turner, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.40 07452
183	Ronal Turner, Deceased	2:18-cv-07153
184	Jeanette Mouton	2:18-cv-07178
185	Erick Barnes	2:18-cv-07187
186	Tammy Perry	2:18-cv-07194
187	Wendy Brazill	2:18-cv-07195
188	Brenda Fletcher	2:18-cv-07203
189	Nancy Esque	2:18-cv-07208
190	Diane McGee, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Kevin	2:18-cv-07239
	McGee, Deceased	
191	George Gale	2:18-cv-07267
192	Fabian Garcia, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:18-cv-07276
	Yolanda Montalvo, Deceased	
193	Joann Flowers, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:18-cv-07320
	Sophia Perkins, Deceased	
194	Thomas Russo	2:18-cv-07340
195	Paul Lue, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Hyacinth	2:18-cv-07352
	Johnson, Deceased	
196	Ernestine Mays-Mitchell, Individually and as the Representative of the	2:18-cv-07365
	Estate of Ernest Mays, Deceased	
	Birdie Woods	2:18-cv-07438
	Betty Apellido	2:18-cv-07557
	Pauline Corn	2:18-cv-07584
<b>_</b>	Gloria Dietrich	2:18-cv-07592
	Walker Howell	2:18-cv-07616
	Stephanie Ralston-Bailey	2:18-cv-07617
	Laura Richie	2:18-cv-07622
	Regina Salisbury	2:18-cv-07632
	Mary Skeens	2:18-cv-07637
	Marlene Hatfield	2:18-cv-07639
207	Sharon Nali	2:18-cv-07667

_		
208	William Solis, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Aura Burgos, Deceased	2:18-cv-07688
209	Ronald Klinenberg	2:18-cv-07706
	Luis Nesta	2:18-cv-07708
211	Lorraine Turco	2:18-cv-07713
212	Hazel Phillips	2:18-cv-07748
	Tracie Powers	2:18-cv-07756
214	Mary Rivali, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Robert Rivali, Deceased	2:18-cv-07760
215	Marilyn Sullivan, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Evelyn Sullivan, Deceased	2:18-cv-07781
216	Bernadine Hardie	2:18-cv-07795
217	Maribel Villanueva, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Alexander Rivera-Baez, Deceased	2:18-cv-07799
218	Karen Vassar, Representative of the Estate of Bobby Vassar, Deceased	2:18-cv-08722
	Odilia Perez	2:19-cv-01061
	Dennis Quintin	2:19-cv-01813
	Martha Griffith	2:19-cv-01853
222	William Hall	2:19-cv-01859
223	Brenda Willis, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Seress Harris, Deceased	2:19-cv-01873
224	Gloria Haywood	2:19-cv-01881
225	Ruth Hurd	2:19-cv-01887
226	Eric Hurwitz	2:19-cv-01889
227	Patricia Joppien	2:19-cv-01897
228	Paul Jozwiak	2:19-cv-01902
229	George Bonis	2:19-cv-01931
230	Raymond Bryant	2:19-cv-01939
231	John Bottoms	2:19-cv-01945
232	Cindy Campbell	2:19-cv-01948
233	Colleen Cantwell	2:19-cv-01965
234	Gladys Carpenter	2:19-cv-01981
235	Brandon Cole	2:19-cv-02004
236	Robert Crenshaw	2:19-cv-02011
237	Wanda Crager	2:19-cv-02012
	Jason Daniels	2:19-cv-02015
239	Luis Manuel Delgado, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Luis C. Delgado, Deceased	2:19-cv-02030
240	Linda McMillen	2:19-cv-02035
241	Odessa Mitchell	2:19-cv-02040
242	Patricia Mitchell	2:19-cv-02048
243	Charles Newsom	2:19-cv-02050
244	Orestes Diaz	2:19-cv-02059
245	Helmut Otto	2:19-cv-02061
246	Darryl Oglesby, as Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Sandra Oglesby, Deceased	2:19-cv-02066
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·	

247	Charlotte Edgar	2:19-cv-02074
	Carey Bowie, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	
248	Henry Bowie, Deceased	2:19-cv-02086
	Maria Edwards, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	
249	Francisca Camacho, Deceased	2:19-cv-02092
250	Warren Ketchmore	2:19-cv-02102
	Juan Cantu, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	
1 /5/11	Margarita Cantu, Deceased	2:19-cv-02104
	Juanita Landers	2:19-cv-02127
253	Karen Gaines	2:19-cv-02136
25.4	Brenda McCurdy, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	0.10 00110
254	Rickey McCurdy, Deceased	2:19-cv-02143
255	Bridgette Long	2:19-cv-02159
25.6	Nettie Overton, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.40 - 02474
256	Charlie Overton, Deceased	2:19-cv-02174
257	Glenda Long	2:19-cv-02175
	Melissa Olson	2:19-cv-02204
259	Raymond Wilson, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.40
259	Randy Orr, Deceased	2:19-cv-02239
260	Sandra Pannell	2:19-cv-02246
261	Priscille Parent	2:19-cv-02261
262	Lucretia Peavy	2:19-cv-02275
	Mabel Perry	2:19-cv-02318
264	Glenna Pool	2:19-cv-02335
265	Debra Primrose	2:19-cv-02356
266	Margaret Pryor, As the Representative of the Estate of Keith Pryor, Deceased	2:19-cv-02367
267	Joyce Sheffield	2:19-cv-02377
	Terry Sheffield	2:19-cv-02386
	Carl Warner	2:19-cv-02456
270	Lionel Smith	2:19-cv-02464
	Sherrie Abrahamson	2:19-cv-02469
272	Linda Stockwell	2:19-cv-02475
	Diane Watkins	2:19-cv-02484
	James Williams	2:19-cv-02487
275	Charles Wiley	2:19-cv-02493
276	Belinda Beck, Individually and as the Administrator of the Estate of Willie Taylor, Deceaed	2:19-cv-02519
277	Nathan Tyler	2:19-cv-02523
	Vivian Wittner, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	
278	Myra Wittner, Deceased	2:19-cv-02531
279	Darwin Valentine	2:19-cv-02547
280	Susan Lynn Wright, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Tabitha Wright, Deceased	2:19-cv-02577
281	Donna Wooten	2:19-cv-02586
282	Sharon Grady, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Herbert Grady, Deceased	2:19-cv-02669

283	Judy K. Freed	2:19-cv-02687
	Connie Black	2:19-cv-02703
285	Laurie J Dey	2:19-cv-02873
286	Esmeralda Olvera, As proposed Representative of the Estate of Santos Olvera, deceased	2:19-CV-02877
287	Ernest J Palmer	2:19-cv-02882
288	Cheryl Adams, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Belle Collins, Deceased	2:19-cv-02996
289	Angela Clark	2:19-cv-03070
290	George Reyes	2:19-cv-03081
291	Joe A. Gottwald	2:19-cv-03115
292	Matt Spasoff	2:19-cv-03117
293	Nancy Fennell	2:19-cv-03132
294	Merle Kirkland	2:19-cv-03272
295	Sheila Holmes	2:19-cv-03327
296	Brenda Y. Ridyolph	2:19-cv-03419
297	Cynthia Tucker	2:19-cv-03489
298	Rosetta T. Cunningham	2:19-cv-03553
	Michelle Denofa, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Frank Denofa, Deceased	2:19-cv-03571
300	Paul E. Dilocker	2:19-cv-03589
	Ruth Edwards	2:19-cv-03595
	Phillip Cottle	2:19-cv-03618
	Jannie Gichia	2:19-cv-03625
	Diana Greathouse	2:19-cv-03633
305	Lena Turknett, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cecilia Gaines, Deceased	2:19-cv-03636
306	Suzanne Coleman-Cunningham	2:19-cv-03638
307	Betty Hunter, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Thomas Hunter, Deceased	2:19-cv-03645
308	Noreen Davis-Xanthis	2:19-cv-03646
309	Juanita Mekwuye	2:19-cv-03652
	Carla A. Dimatteo	2:19-cv-03658
311	Barbara Zajack	2:19-cv-03663
	Jennifer Collins	2:19-cv-03679
313	Melissa Harris	2:19-cv-03684
314	Tracy Henderson	2:19-cv-03685
	Linwood Flemister	2:19-cv-03686
316	James W. Franklin, Sr.	2:19-cv-03711
317	Keisha Kimbrough	2:19-cv-03723
318	Cynthia Lawhorn	2:19-cv-03739
319	Lynell Johnson	2:19-cv-03784
320	Michael Anthony Jones	2:19-cv-03806
321	Cara Kreider	2:19-cv-03817
322	Stephen C. McNeill	2:19-cv-03823
272	Michael DePhillipo, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Felice DePhillipo, Deceased	2:19-cv-03858

324	Tammy R. Phipps	2:19-cv-03863
325	Melissa Konarski, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:19-cv-03869
	Pamela Zaccardi, Deceased	2.13 0 03003
326	Kevin M. Takacs	2:19-cv-03921
	Anna B. Franks	2:19-cv-03984
	Brandon R. Ward	2:19-cv-03987
	Raymond A. Watson	2:19-cv-04002
	Darren Williams	2:19-cv-04012
	Belinda L. Laird	2:19-cv-04031
	Anita Loudy	2:19-cv-04113
	Sandra Detherage	2:19-cv-04133
334	Carol Rosenblum	2:19-cv-04146
	Linda Barnett	2:19-cv-04152
	Keith Ellery	2:19-cv-04166
337	Kerry Bland	2:19-cv-04178
338	Denise Garrette	2:19-cv-04188
339	Josette Schaffer	2:19-cv-04192
340	John Danso, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Vickie	2:19-cv-04204
340	Danso, Deceased	2.19-CV-U42U4
341	Lawrence Lucerne	2:19-cv-04209
342	Sandra Mason	2:19-cv-04218
343	Beverly McCaleb	2:19-cv-04224
344	Karen E. Rawlings	2:19-cv-04226
345	Veda McDonald-Rhodes, Individually and as the Representative of the	2.10 04220
345	Estate of Andre McDonald, Deceased	2:19-cv-04228
346	Joanne Smith	2:19-cv-04234
347	Diane Wood	2:19-cv-04242
348	Terry L. Tharp	2:19-cv-04250
349	Donald Torgerson	2:19-cv-04254
350	Mary Burchett	2:19-cv-04470
351	Michael Bowen	2:19-cv-04503
352	Curtis Banks, Jr.	2:19-cv-04514
353	Catherine Antwine	2:19-cv-04516
354	Jackie L. Brown	2:19-cv-04518
355	Joseph A. Archer	2:19-cv-04519
356	Margie T. Bannister	2:19-cv-04528
357	Leta Bannon	2:19-cv-04535
358	Janice Weibley, on behalf of Elizabeth L. Boyd	2:19-cv-04537
359	Richard Bailey	2:19-cv-04559
360	Debra Bramblett	2:19-cv-04561
361	Brent Bregan	2:19-cv-04574
362	Renee E. Adkins	2:19-cv-04623
363	Damisha L. Bishop	2:19-cv-04684
364	Joe Alfieri	2:19-cv-04690
365	Shirley Bass	2:19-cv-04703
366	Alice Baxter	2:19-cv-04722

	Anna Gonzalez, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Beatrice Ceja,	
367	Deceased	2:19-cv-04750
368	Twila M. Dillon	2:19-cv-04790
369	Dora Chatman	2:19-cv-04826
	David A. Ealy	2:19-cv-04837
371	Albert G. Collins	2:19-cv-04853
372	Nelda Dugas	2:19-cv-04861
	James Drain	2:19-cv-04863
374	Tina Dasher	2:19-cv-04882
	Augusta L. Colson	2:19-cv-04909
	John Elliott	2:19-cv-04913
	David Andrews	2:19-cv-04914
	Adela Anguiano	2:19-cv-04927
	Troy Ersch	2:19-cv-04932
	Ronald R. Francis	2:19-cv-04975
	Angela Clinton	2:19-cv-04981
	Robin Fizhugh	2:19-cv-05006
	Mary Duncan	2:19-cv-05072
	Charlotte Edwards	2:19-cv-05097
	Matilda Gagliardi	2:19-cv-05119
	Barbara S. Foutty	2:19-cv-05132
	Angela K. Henry	2:19-cv-05185
	Bobby G Jones	2:19-cv-05196
	Darlene Huettenberger	2:19-cv-05197
	Gary D. Johnson	2:19-cv-05199
	Helen Humphrey	2:19-cv-05243
	Ronnie W. Johnson	2:19-cv-05247
	Donna Hines	2:19-cv-05275
	Denice M Justice	2:19-cv-05307
	Connie Ivory	2:19-cv-05324
	Constance Gary	2:19-cv-05335
	Barton S. Hickey	2:19-cv-05353
	Marne Gonzales	2:19-cv-05355
	Pamela Kazak	2:19-cv-05369
-	Phyllis J. Kinsey	2:19-cv-05376
<u> </u>	Steven Graham	2:19-cv-05547
	June S. Grumbein	2:19-cv-05558
	Alcadio Guajardo, III	2:19-cv-05583
	Theresa R. Grove	2:19-cv-05606
	Darren Gines	2:19-cv-05608
	Connie Gamez	2:19-cv-05652
	Paul Glasper	2:19-cv-05699
	Doris Harder	2:19-cv-05791
	Rashidah Id-Deen	2:19-cv-05805
-	Bonnie Holtgrew	2:19-cv-05814
	Jeffrey A Heaps	2:19-cv-05853
412	Terica Lemon	2:19-cv-06014

	Gail H. Mills	2:19-cv-06072
	Lisa Mitchell	2:19-cv-06080
	Berchia M. Mitchell	2:19-cv-06106
	Jason R. Mitchell	2:19-cv-06110
	Anna Hoppes	2:19-cv-06157
	Carson E. Wingo	2:19-cv-06224
	Joe N. Little	2:19-cv-06225
	Betty J. Withrow	2:19-cv-06226
	Annette London	2:19-cv-06231
	Penny E Wolfe	2:19-cv-06237
	Melissa Lonsdale	2:19-cv-06246
	Richard A. Lovelace	2:19-cv-06320
425	Desiree Lovins	2:19-cv-06323
	Betty Lowther	2:19-cv-06374
	Joseph W. Lucas	2:19-cv-06376
<b>_</b>	Martin Masar Jr.	2:19-cv-06432
429	James Mason	2:19-cv-06444
	Lynda Mercer	2:19-cv-06456
431	Lena Woolfolk	2:19-cv-06457
432	Arlene Miller	2:19-cv-06496
433	Thelma McClellen	2:19-cv-06520
434	Brenda McConnachie	2:19-cv-06522
435	Grachell L. Manuel	2:19-cv-06537
436	Uri Moscovici	2:19-cv-06541
437	Marilyn Young	2:19-cv-06599
438	Terry Hays-Booker	2:19-cv-06613
439	Missouri McCann	2:19-cv-06614
440	Marybelle J. Nohejl and Donald Nohejl	2:19-cv-06648
441	Colton Norwood	2:19-cv-06653
442	Norma J. Ochoa	2:19-cv-06657
443	Herschel Overby	2:19-cv-06681
444	Sherrie Owerko	2:19-cv-06685
445	Deborah L. Patterson	2:19-cv-06706
446	Shirley Murray	2:19-cv-06713
447	David Peterson, Sr.	2:19-cv-06827
448	Leonard Nesbitt	2:19-cv-06828
449	Alvin Williamson	2:19-cv-06848
450	David O. Pinto	2:19-cv-06874
451	Andrew E. Polly	2:19-cv-06890
452	Emily Nichols	2:19-cv-06894
	Joyce Niemi	2:19-cv-06899
454	Norma Wright	2:19-cv-06918
	Misty C. Powell	2:19-cv-06966
-	Leon Rhodes and Veronica Rhodes	2:19-cv-06967
	Linda Roach	2:19-cv-07057
	Sharon Raabe	2:19-cv-07069
	Martha Bruton	2:19-cv-07076

460	Brian Rose	2:19-cv-07133
	Brandi Peebles	2:19-cv-07166
	William Schiffert	2:19-cv-07203
	Darlet A. Simile	2:19-cv-07208
	Ben Schwartz	2:19-cv-07238
	Robert Smith	2:19-cv-07247
403		2.19-60-07247
466	Rita Scott, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of Melvern Scott, Deceased	2:19-cv-07250
467	Roberta Ruddy	2:19-cv-07297
468	Scott E. Shaner	2:19-cv-07348
469	Amos Smith	2:19-cv-07350
470	Anita L. Shank	2:19-cv-07352
471	Sharon Smith	2:19-cv-07389
472	Valorie Sherrod	2:19-cv-07390
473	Annette H. Shook	2:19-cv-07400
474	Ysleta Smith	2:19-cv-07403
475	Arlene Sidenstick	2:19-cv-07425
476	Heidi McGee	2:19-cv-07516
477	Laronda M. McMurray	2:19-cv-07540
	Shanda M. Meacacke	2:19-cv-07543
479	Brenda Swift	2:19-cv-07558
	Dawn Takacs	2:19-cv-07560
	Ruby M. Terrasas	2:19-cv-07589
	Pamela D. Terry	2:19-cv-07590
	Ruth Thompson	2:19-cv-07605
	Cheryl Russell	2:19-cv-07635
	Courtney Stark	2:19-cv-07636
	Sally D. Reed	2:19-cv-07642
	Sandra Steen	2:19-cv-07658
	Sonja F. Anthony	2:19-cv-07681
	Nadine Reese	2:19-cv-07732
	Tammy Sateriale	2:19-cv-07793
	Arnoldo Sauceda	2:19-cv-07799
	Rodney Stewart	2:19-cv-07799 2:19-cv-07800
	Nicholas Savini	2:19-cv-07825
	Joan v. Streek	2:19-cv-07857
	Emma L. White	2:19-cv-07869
	Susan Reitz	2:19-cv-07869 2:19-cv-07879
	Kevin Wiggs	2:19-cv-07879 2:19-cv-07893
	Robert W. Tonini	ł
		2:19-cv-07908
	Carmen Vitello	2:19-cv-08007
500	Brenda J. Wadman	2:19-cv-08050
501	Jami Butler, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of David Ayers, Deceased	2:19-cv-08067
502	Bonnie S. Walburn	2:19-cv-08097
503	Dianne C. Walker	2:19-cv-08137
504	Darlene Watson	2:19-cv-08319

	Classim, Markasin	2.40 - 00222
	Cherry Watson	2:19-cv-08323
	Corderro Watts	2:19-cv-08325
	Wayne Price	2:19-cv-08421
	Daniel E. Varner	2:19-cv-08449
	Audrey M. Werner	2:19-cv-08547
	Joseph White Sr.	2:19-cv-08573
511	Robert Acosta	2:19-cv-08709
512	Wilma Bibbs	2:19-cv-10048
513	Shirley Brantley	2:19-cv-10050
514	Esther Garza, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Jorge	2:19-cv-10059
	Garza, Deceased	
	James Goff	2:19-cv-10060
	Regla Hernandez	2:19-cv-10064
517	Elizabeth Hoover, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Katharina Hoover, Deceased	2:19-cv-10069
518	Barbara Jensen	2:19-cv-10072
	Lorenzo Limon	2:19-cv-10079
	Andrew Mae Martin	2:19-cv-10083
	Delaine Moore	2:19-cv-10087
321	Allawana Parsons, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.15-CV-10007
522	Smith Parsons, Deceased	2:19-cv-10088
523	Lydia Robinson	2:19-cv-10092
	Felicita Santos	2:19-cv-10094
	Margaret Chappel, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2.13-00-10034
525	Adrian Smith, Deceased	2:19-cv-10102
526	Ernestine Thompson	2:19-cv-10115
	Rosa Vega	2:19-cv-10119
	Katie Ware	2:19-cv-10141
	Barbara Wargo	2:19-cv-10141 2:19-cv-10142
	Billy Wiginton	2:19-cv-10143
	Scott Wright	2:19-cv-10145
	Brenda Wyatt	2:19-cv-10146
533	Sheila Cuffee, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Corinne Blackwell, Deceased	2:19-cv-10147
534	Terri Bullock Dortmundt	2:19-cv-10715
535	Elisa Puentes, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Lucy Hernandez, Deceased	2:19-cv-11000
526	Kimberly Ann Tomajko	2:19-cv-11010
230	Billie Whitehead, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	Z.13-CV-11010
537	Artis Whitehead, Deceased	2:19-cv-11013
538	Judy Edwards	2:19-cv-11320
539	Kevin Hickles, Sr.	2:19-cv-11329
	George D. Pulford	2:19-cv-11375
	Roxanne Robertson	2:19-cv-11575
	Julia K. Strickland	2:19-cv-11582
	Sharon L. Thorne	2:19-cv-11585
	Dian F. Umbaugh	2:19-cv-11590
274	Didn't Chibaden	2.15 0 11550

545	Josephine Cumbo	2:19-cv-11776
	Terri McCrea, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Franklin D.	2:19-cv-11857
	McCrea, Sr.	
	Nina Rosemond	2:19-cv-11862
	Temika Smith	2:19-cv-11866
	Lucy M. Spinner	2:19-cv-11888
550	Doris Bowens	2:19-cv-13354
	Raymond Brisson	2:19-cv-13490
	Earnest Thomas	2:19-cv-13491
	Gregory Lomax	2:19-cv-13677
	Arthuretta Watford	2:19-cv-13678
555	Thomas Bradd	2:19-cv-14061
556	Davida Linn-Cammarano, Individually and as the Representative of the	2:19-cv-14064
330	Estate of Frank Cammarano, Deceased	2.13-00-14004
557	Marilyn Padgett, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:19-cv-14065
337	Novalynn Collins, Deceased	2.19-00-14005
558	Paul Cyrus	2:19-cv-14066
559	Joshua Cole	2:19-cv-14513
560	Karen King	2:19-cv-14732
561	Louis Brown, Jr., Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2,10 ov 15241
201	Irene Brown, Deceased	2:19-cv-15341
562	Louis Brown, Jr., Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2,10 ov 15242
302	Lewis Brown, Sr., Deceased	2:19-cv-15342
563	Jeffrey Taylor	2:19-cv-15345
564	Eddie Felder	2:19-cv-15445
565	Karen Wells, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:19-cv-15570
303	Michael Wells, Deceased	2.19-60-15570
566	Larry Moore	2:19-cv-15571
567	Paul Greer	2:19-cv-15777
568	Mark Marcello	2:19-cv-15881
569	Marilyn Pritchard	2:19-cv-16196
570	Carol Presley	2:19-cv-16903
571	Danny Garabedian	2:19-cv-16905
572	Robert McCray	2:19-cv-17096
573	Jack Schonenberger	2:19-cv-17541
574	Victor Rodriguez, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of	2:19-cv-17658
3/4	Susan Rodriguez, Deceased	Z.13-UV-1/030
575	Stephen Marchut	2:19-cv-17991
576	Richard Elstun	2:19-cv-18108
577	Karen Arndt	2:19-cv-18304
	Karen Arndt Shirley Howard	2:19-cv-18304 2:19-cv-19780
578		
578 579	Shirley Howard	2:19-cv-19780
578 579 580	Shirley Howard Robin Noblin	2:19-cv-19780 2:19-cv-19781
578 579 580 581	Shirley Howard Robin Noblin James Cadieux	2:19-cv-19780 2:19-cv-19781 2:19-cv-21720

# Case 2:19-cv-10050-CCC-LDW Document 11 Filed 05/09/23 Page 29 of 30 PageID: 200 Exhibit A

Alonia Williams, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of I.G. Thompson, Sr., Deceased	2:19-cv-22153
Weldon Paul Steadman, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Phyllis Steadman, Deceased	2:19-cv-22221
586 Jonathan E Beckham	2:20-cv-00979
587 Kimberly J Burrows	2:20-cv-00984
588 Kenneth B. Cousette	2:20-cv-00986
589 Edward L. Thomas	2:20-cv-01015
590 Stephen Deloney	2:20-cv-01028
591 Kathreen Hensley	2:20-cv-01523
592 Brenda Williams, Individually and as PR of the Estate of Alvin Williams	2:20-cv-01844
593 Sterling Binns	2:20-cv-02070
594 Martha Jones	2:20-cv-03162
595 Ernest Nelson Jr.	2:20-cv-03422
596 Pasquale A Palange	2:20-cv-04531
597 Elena Patrizio	2:20-cv-04539
598 Dorothy R Lewis	2:20-cv-04636
599 Barbara Minchew	2:20-cv-04644
600 Rebecca Ann Gordon	2:20-cv-04667
601 Janice C. Rodgers	2:20-cv-04740
602 Gary Friend	2:20-cv-04760
603 Charles F Duke	2:20-cv-04792
604 Linda B Ross	2:20-cv-04811
605 Cheryl K Strouse	2:20-cv-04829
606 Glenda Weeks	2:20-cv-04841
Sherry White, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Raymond White, Deceased	2:20-cv-04844
608 Jacqueline Williams	2:20-cv-04846
609 Mary Zangara	2:20-cv-04850
610 William Clinton	2:20-cv-04884
611 Robert Shawn Trybala	2:20-cv-04923
612 Jane Cedar	2:20-cv-04940
613 Alma J. Williams	2:20-cv-04956
614 Jennefer Prepelica	2:20-cv-04957
615 John E. Pumphrey, Jr.	2:20-cv-04962
616 Sue Brewer	2:20-cv-05029
617 Joan C. Harper	2:20-cv-05040
618 Ella Norman	2:20-cv-05052
619 Susan M. Pierce	2:20-cv-05066
Hyram Archdale, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Kathleen K. Price, Deceased	2:20-cv-05070
621 Christopher Ritenour	2:20-cv-05077
622 Laura J Sutphin	2:20-cv-05079
623 Quintina N. Wright	2:20-cv-05088
624 James Ziegler	2:20-cv-05092
625 Marie Stacey	2:20-cv-05244

# Case 2:19-cv-10050-CCC-LDW Document 11 Filed 05/09/23 Page 30 of 30 PageID: 201 Exhibit A

626	Robert Keenan, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Douglas W. Keenan, Deceased	2:20-cv-05266
627	Karen Boyer	2:20-cv-05327
628	William Broyles, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Mary J. Broyles, Deceased	2:20-cv-05329
629	Renee McPheeters, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Mary Lou Christopher, Deceased	2:20-cv-05343
630	Linda Donaldson	2:20-cv-05344
631	Barbara Dryer	2:20-cv-05345
632	Eva M Longino	2:20-cv-05354
633	Debra Mitchell, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Dennis M. Mitchell, Deceased	2:20-cv-05360
634	Vonda Smith, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Thomas D. Smith, Deceased	2:20-cv-05368
635	John Johnson	2:20-cv-05380
636	Sharon D. Lee	2:20-cv-06715
637	Victor Culpepper, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Lisa Culpepper, Deceased	2:20-cv-06986
638	Brenda Kellam	2:20-cv-07294
639	Sandra Loesche	2:20-cv-07344
640	Alex Montiel	2:20-cv-07345